

CHRIS CHRISTIE Governor

KIM GUADAGNO Lt. Governor

TRENTON, NEW JERSEY 08625

STEFANIE A. BRAND Director

April 19, 2013

VIA REGULAR AND ELECTRONIC MAIL

Honorable Kristi Izzo, Secretary New Jersey Board of Public Utilities 44 South Clinton Avenue, 9th Floor P.O. Box 350 Trenton, New Jersey 08625

> Re: **CEEEP Energy Efficiency Cost-Benefit**

> > **Analysis Avoided Cost Assumptions**

(Revised October 22, 2012)

Dear Secretary Izzo:

Enclosed please find original and ten copies of comments submitted on behalf of the New Jersey Division of Rate Counsel in connection with the above-captioned matter. Copies of the comments are being provided to all parties by electronic mail and hard copies will be provided upon request to our office.

We are enclosing one additional copy of the comments. Please stamp and date the extra copy as "filed" and return it in our self-addressed stamped envelope.

Honorable Kristi Izzo, Secretary April 19, 2013 Page -2-

Thank you for your consideration and assistance.

Respectfully submitted,

STEFANIE A. BRAND Director, Division of Rate Counsel

By:

KSL/bw

Kurt S. Lewandowski, Esq. Assistant Deputy Rate Counsel

c: (via e-mail)

OCE@bpu.state.nj.us

EE Committee Listserv

Rachel Boylan, Esq.,-BPU

Mike Winka, BPU

Anne Marie McShea, BPU

Mona Mosser, BPU

Benjamin Hunter, BPU

Frank Felder, CEEEP

Jaci Trzaska, CEEEP

Re: CEEEP Energy Efficiency Cost-Benefit Analysis Avoided Cost Assumptions (Revised October 22, 2012)

Comments submitted by the New Jersey Division of Rate Counsel

April 19, 2013

Please accept these comments on behalf of the New Jersey Division of Rate Counsel ("Rate Counsel") in response to the request circulated by the Office of Clean Energy on or about April 3, 2013. The within comments address the assumptions used by the Rutgers Center for Energy, Economic & Environmental Policy ("CEEEP") to develop their report, dated October 22, 2012, entitled *Energy Efficiency Cost-Benefit Analysis Avoided Cost Assumptions* ("2nd Revised Draft"). CEEEP's underlying cost benefit analysis examines combined heat and power ("CHP") and other distributed generation ("DG") options. On August 6, 2012, Rate Counsel submitted comments on an earlier draft of CEEEP's report ("1st Revised Draft"), dated July 25, 2012. With these April 19th comments, Rate Counsel comments on CEEEP's 2nd Revised Draft, and also supplements and incorporates by reference its August 6, 2012 comments on CEEEP's 1st Revised Draft.

Rate Counsel's comments focus on certain electricity prices used in the 2nd Revised Draft. In Table 1of the 2nd Revised Draft, CEEEP presents its retail electricity price forecast by sector. Rate Counsel suggests that the retail prices appear to be high relative to historic retail electricity prices and should be updated. Based on the February, 2013 EIA Electric Power Monthly, the retail electricity price in 2011 for residential customers in New Jersey was \$0.16/kwh, much lower than CEEEP's assumption of \$0.18/kwh. Likewise, the 2011 loadweighted commercial and industrial price in New Jersey was \$0.13/kwh, much lower than the price of \$0.15/kwh assumed by CEEEP for that year. For 2012, the residential price is

\$0.16/kwh according to the February 2013 Electric Power Monthly, in contrast with CEEEP's assumption of \$0.18/kwh. The 2012 load-weighted commercial and industrial price in New Jersey was \$ 0.12/kwh, compared with the price of \$0.14/kwh assumed by CEEEP for that year. 1 These prices are summarized in Table A, below.

Table A. Retail Electricity Price (\$/kWh)²

	Residential		Commercial & Industrial	
	CEEEP	EIA	CEEEP	EIA
2011	0.1800	0.1623	0.1500	0.1314
2012	0.1800	0.1579	0.1400	0.1247

Rate Counsel recommends that CEEEP revisit its electricity price assumptions and incorporates the suggestions set forth above.

Based on data from the U.S. Energy Information Administration. Electric Power Monthly: tables 5.4.A and 5.6.B, release date February 2013.
CEEEP data from 2nd Revised Draft. EIA data from the U.S. Energy Information Administration. Electric Power Monthly: tables 5.4.A and 5.6.B, release date February 2013.